BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY
ATTORNEYS AT LAW
36 EAST SEVENTH STREET
SUITE 1510
CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202
TELEPHONE (513) 421-2255

TELECOPIER (513) 421-2764

Via E-File

October 29, 2012

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
PUCO Docketing
180 E. Broad Street, 10th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

In re: 11-346-EL-SSO, 11-348-EL-SSO
11-349-EL-AAM, 11-350-EL-AAM

Dear Sir/Madam:

Please find attached the OHIO ENERGY GROUP's INITIAL COMMENTS TO THE OCTOBER 25, 2012 CBP STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP for filing in the above-referenced matters.

Copies have been served on all parties on the attached certificate of service. Please place this document of file.

Respectfully yours,

David F. Boehm, Esq.
Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.
Kurt J. Boehm, Esq.
BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY

MLKkew
Encl.
Cc: ALJ Greta See, Esq. (via electronic mail)
ALJ Jonathan Tauber, Esq. (via electronic mail)
Chairman Todd A. Snitchler (via electronic mail)
Commissioner Cheryl Roberto (via electronic mail)
Commissioner Steven D. Lesser (via electronic mail)
Commissioner Andre T. Porter (via electronic mail)
Commissioner Lynn Slaby (via electronic mail)
Eric Weldele, PUCO Chief of Staff (via electronic mail)
Certificate of Service

BEFORE THE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan.	:	**Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO** **Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO**
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority	:	**Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM** **Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM**

INITIAL COMMENTS TO THE OCTOBER 25, 2012 CBP STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP OF THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

David F. Boehm, Esq.
Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.
Kurt J. Boehm, Esq.
BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Ph: 513.421.2255 Fax: 513.421.2764
DBoehm@BKLlawfirm.com
MKurtz@BKLlawfirm.com
KBoehm@BKLlawfirm.com

COUNSEL FOR THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

October 29, 2012

BEFORE THE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan.	:	**Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO** **Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO**
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority	:	**Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM** **Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM**

INITIAL COMMENTS TO
THE OCTOBER 25, 2012 CBP STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP OF
THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

The Ohio Energy Group ("OEG") files these comments in response to the October 25, 2012 CBP Stakeholder Workshop held pursuant to the Commission's August 8, 2012 Order establishing a new ESP for AEP Ohio ("ESP Order"). With respect to the CBP bidding rules, the ESP Order provided:

> *...the substantive details of the CBP process need to be established to maximize the number of participants in AEP-Ohio's auctions through an open and transparent auction process. We direct AEP-Ohio to establish a CBP process consistent with Section 4928.142, Revised Code, by December 31, 2012. The CBP should include guidelines to ensure an independent third party is selected to ensure there is an open and transparent solicitation process, a standard bid evaluation, and clear product definitions. We encourage AEP-Ohio to look to recent successful CBP processes, such as Duke Energy-Ohio's, in formulating its CBP. Further, AEP-Ohio is ordered to initiate a stakeholder process within 30 days from the date of this opinion and order.*[1]

[1] ESP Order at 40.

The ESP Order, inter alia, determined that in order for customers to "*take advantage of market-based prices and the benefits of developing a healthy competitive market,*" non-shopping SSO customers should transition to market pricing prior to the June 1, 2015 energy and capacity auction for AEP Ohio's entire SSO load.[2] Unlike the competitive bid processes established for the FirstEnergy and Duke utilities, wherein non-shopping SSO customers were served by a "*flash-cut*" auction for both energy and capacity without a transition period, a transitional hybrid approach was established for AEP Ohio. Under the AEP Ohio hybrid approach, non-shopping SSO customers will continue to pay for legacy generation capacity priced at average embedded cost until June 1, 2015, but their energy will be subject to a blend of average cost pricing (fuel adjustment clause, or "FAC") and marginal cost (market) pricing resulting from an energy-only auction. Pricing in the energy-only auctions will also include a risk premium to compensate bidders for migration risk as well as a profit margin.

The ESP Order states that, six months after a corporation separation order is issued, 10% of AEP Ohio's SSO energy requirements will be subject to a CBP auction process.[3] AEP Ohio estimates that this 10% energy-only auction will be effective July 1, 2013.[4] At the October 25, 2012 Stakeholder Workshop, AEP Ohio also estimated that 10% of the SSO energy load will equal approximately 2.5 million MWh. Later, for service commencing June 1, 2014, non-shopping SSO load will be served with capacity priced at average embedded cost and 40% of energy priced at average cost through the FAC and 60% of energy priced at marginal cost through an energy-only auction.[5] According to AEP Ohio's auction consultant, NERA Economic Consulting, Ohio is the only jurisdiction which has established a hybrid rate structure for service to non-shopping SSO load, whereby capacity is priced at average embedded cost while some portion of energy is priced at marginal cost via auction.

[2] ESP Order at 39-40.
[3] ESP Order at 39.
[4] "AEP Ohio CBP First Stakeholder Workshop" Presentation by AEP Ohio (October 25, 2012) at 5.
[5] ESP Order at 40.

Because of the uniqueness of AEP Ohio's hybrid structure, and to ensure that customers actually do benefit from competition during the transition period, as the Commission intends, the Commission should establish one important auction protocol: the starting price for the descending clock energy-only auctions for each AEP Ohio rate zone should be the forecasted FAC rate that customers would otherwise pay. Establishing the forecasted FAC rate for the Ohio Power ("OP") and Columbus Southern ("CSP") rate zones as the "price to beat" will guard against a self-imposed and unnecessary rate increase on SSO customers. In addition, because AEP Ohio is allowed to participate in its own auctions, setting the forecasted FACs as the auction starting prices will prevent a situation where the same utility provides the same energy to the same customers, but at a higher price.

1. The Commission Should Establish The Starting Price For The Descending Clock Energy-Only Auctions For Each AEP Ohio Rate Zone At The Forecasted FAC Rate That Customers Would Otherwise Pay.

There is a risk that the energy-only auctions based upon locational marginal cost ("LMP") plus a risk premium and a profit margin for the bidders could result in unnecessary and avoidable rate increases to customers compared to the cost-based energy rates that those customers would otherwise have paid through the FAC. SSO customers are entitled to cost-based energy rates with no risk premium or profit margin in exchange for the payment of a cost-based charge (including a return of and a return on invested capital) for generating capacity. As the Commission is painfully aware, AEP Ohio's cost-based capacity charge embedded in its legacy SSO generation rates significantly exceeds the marginal or market-based cost of capacity as determined through the PJM RPM capacity auctions. For example, OP's GS-4 primary voltage demand charge of $10.44/kW/month is equivalent to $343/MW-day.

SSO customers pay average embedded costs for capacity through the legacy cost-based rate structure. Historically, this has meant that customers paid high capacity costs associated with AEP Ohio's predominately base load coal generation (in excess of $300/MW-day), but those high capacity costs were offset by low coal-based energy prices based upon the utilities' actual costs with no profit margin or risk premium. However, an energy-only auction will be based upon marginal prices (market pricing) plus a risk premium and profit margin. The result of the energy-only auction could be that SSO customers will pay the utility's average embedded cost for capacity and marginal or market rates for 10%-60% of their energy. This hybrid structure is unique to Ohio and unique to the rest of the country.

The worst case scenario for SSO customers would be if they are required to pay high average embedded capacity costs based upon base load coal generation and high marginal cost (market) energy rates, plus a risk premium and supplier profit margin. By properly setting the starting auction price at the projected FACs of OP and CSP (which AEP Ohio can provide through its normal budgeting process), the Commission can avoid this scenario.

There will be no harm to AEP Ohio as a result of setting the starting price for the energy-only auction at the price consumers would have otherwise paid. The quid pro quo for receiving a cost-based rate for legacy generation from SSO customers is the provision of energy from those coal units at cost. Of course, the $188.88/MW-day capacity rate that AEP Ohio is authorized to charge CRES providers is net of energy margins, which largely explains why it is lower than the cost-based capacity rate charged to SSO load. In this sense, it is more accurate to describe the cost-based rate for capacity to serve SSO load as "*gross cost*" and for capacity provided to CRES providers as "*net cost*." This distinction is similar to the net versus gross CONE (cost of new entry) used by PJM.

It is important to recognize that if 2.5 million MWh of SSO load is served by auction, then that will free up a like amount of energy for AEP Ohio to sell into the wholesale market as off-system sales. The Commission should be aware that for the first six months of the 10% energy auction the AEP Pool Agreement will still be in effect. This means that off-system sales profits earned by AEP Ohio during that six month period will be shared according to their respective Member Load Ratios with the AEP affiliates in West Virginia, Virginia, Kentucky, Indiana and Michigan. The end result would be that SSO consumers in Ohio will suffer, while the out-of-state AEP affiliates and their ratepayers will benefit at our expense.

Alternatively, instead of making wholesale sales with the freed up 2.5 million MWh, AEP Ohio could bid on its own auction load. If the starting auction price is not set at the forecasted FACs, then for any auction tranches won AEP Ohio, the same utility would be providing the same energy to the same customers, but at a higher price.

It is hard to estimate how much consumers stand to lose if the 10% energy-only auction starting price is not set at the projected FACs. But based upon the results of the October 23, 2012 FirstEnergy auction, where the clearing price for energy and capacity was $60.89/MWh, a reasonable estimate can be made. (Because the Commission has access to the unredacted bid documents, it is possible that the Commission knows the non-capacity component of that bid with certainty). If the capacity component of the $60.89/MWh auction clearing price was $15/MWh, then the remainder of $45.89 represents marginal cost energy, risk premium and supplier profit. On average between the OP and CSP rate zones, this represents an increase of about $10/MWh, or about $25 million annually. If the Commission wants a more accurate estimate, then NERA Economic Consulting is certainly is a good position to provide that.

For the final year of the ESP (June 1, 2014 through June 1, 2015), where the marginal cost energy-only auction blend is 60%, simple multiplication puts the harm to consumers at $150 million. But that number could be higher or lower as future market prices for energy are largely a function of natural gas prices and are therefore difficult to predict, as are AEP Ohio's coal costs. However, it would be unfair to assert that the additional profit which AEP Ohio or its out-of-state affiliates could earn from the energy-only auctions was part of a comprehensive strategy. After all, AEP Ohio originally sought an energy-only auction of just 5%.

A belief that consumers will be protected in the final year of the ESP through the 12% ROE earnings cap is probably unfounded. After the AEP Pool Agreement is terminated and generation divestiture is complete on December 31, 2013, the earnings from generation will no longer be on the books of the utility. As a practical matter, the 12% ROE earnings cap established in the ESP will probably only provide protection from excess generation profits for calendar years 2012 and 2013.

It is possible that individual customers may be protected from undue rate increases stemming from the energy-only auctions by the 12% customer rate impact cap established in the ESP. The 12% customer rate impact cap applies to "*items approved within this modified ESP*."[6] To the extent that the energy-only auctions are covered, then individual customers would be protected. But that would simply mean deferrals would be created which could raise rates on all consumers. The problem would not go away. The better solution is to stop the damage in the first place by setting the auction starting price at the FAC rates customers would have otherwise paid.

There may be some concern that setting the descending clock auction starting price at the forecasted FAC rates will somehow chill the market or deter bidding. If bidding is deterred, then it simply means that competitors cannot beat the energy rate to which consumers are entitled by virtue of

[6] ESP Order at 70.

paying a cost-based rate for capacity. From a consumer and economic development point of view, there is certainly nothing wrong with maintaining low prices. Any concern about a long-term chilling of the market for auction bids is overstated. The *"flash cut"* energy and capacity auction at the end of 2011 for 100% of Duke's SSO load had multiple bidders and went smoothly. No transitional auctions were needed for Duke. Likewise, no transitional auctions were needed for FirstEnergy as it has been conducting energy and capacity auctions for 100% of its SSO load without incident for many years. The same will almost certainly be true for AEP Ohio on June 1, 2015.

AEP Ohio's ESP and related Capacity Case forced the Commission to quickly grapple with many complicated and inter-related issues. Unintended consequences were inevitable. We respectfully suggest that the concerns raised herein may not have been anticipated by the Commission, but are curable.

The Commission has the authority to establish the descending clock energy-only auction starting price at the rate consumers would otherwise pay (the forecasted FAC by rate zone). Given the unique hybrid auction structure established in the ESP, which is a first in America, exercising that authority is warranted so that the transition to full competition is truly a benefit for consumers as the Commission intended.

2. **Separate Energy-Only Auctions Should Be Held For Each AEP Ohio Rate Zone To Maintain Consistency With The Manner In Which The Fuel Adjustment Clause Will Be Recovered.**

Because the Commission decided to maintain separate FAC rates for the OP and CSP rate zones during the term of the ESP,[7] the energy-only auctions approved by the Commission should likewise be

[7] ESP Order at 17.

held separately for each rate zone. This is because the "*price to beat*" differs significantly for each rate zone.

For high voltage customers the FAC rate for the OP rate zone is $32.41/MWh. The corresponding FAC rate for the CSP rate zone is $38.38/MWh. Hence, the FAC rate for CSP customers is approximately $6/MWh higher than OP's rate. This approximately $6/MWh difference between rate zones also applies to the FAC rates of secondary and primary voltage customers.[8] Because the FAC rate for CSP customers is significantly higher than OP's rate, the "*price to beat*" is also significantly higher for the CSP rate zone. Consequently, if the energy-only auctions are not held separately for each rate zone, then the auction clearing price may lead to unreasonably high energy rates for OP customers. To avoid this result, the energy-only auctions should be held separately for each rate zone.

Respectfully Submitted,

David F. Boehm, Esq.
Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.
Kurt J. Boehm, Esq.
BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Ph: 513.421.2255 Fax: 513.421.2764
DBoehm@BKLlawfirm.com
MKurtz@BKLlawfirm.com
KBoehm@BKLlawfirm.com

October 29, 2012

COUNSEL FOR THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

[8] OP's FAC rate for Secondary customers is $34.26/MWh and CSP's FAC rate for such customers is $40.57/MWh. OP's FAC rate for Primary customers is $33.07/MWh and CSP's FAC rate for such customers is $39.16/MWh.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that true copy of the foregoing was served by electronic mail (when available) or ordinary mail, unless otherwise noted, this 29th day of October, 2012 the following:

David F. Boehm, Esq.
Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.
Kurt J. Boehm, Esq.

JOE HAMROCK
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA 29TH FL
COLUMBUS OH 43215

SATTERWHITE, MATTHEW
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA 29TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

APPALACHIAN PEACE AND JUSTICE NETWORK, C/O
MICHAEL SMALZ OHIO POVERTY LAW CENTER
555 BUTTLES AVENUE
COLUMBUS OH 43215

SMALZ, MICHAEL ATTORNEY AT LAW
OHIO STATE LEGAL SERVICE ASSOC.
555 BUTTLES AVENUE
COLUMBUS OH 43215-1137

COLUMBUS SOUTHERN POWER COMPANY
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA
COLUMBUS OH 43215

NOURSE , STEVEN T. MR.
AMERICAN ELECTRIC POWER
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA
COLUMBUS OH 43215

OHIO POWER COMPANY
LEGAL DEPARTMENT
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA
COLUMBUS OH 43215

BONNER, DOUGLAS G. ATTORNEY
SONNENSCHEIN NATH & ROSENTHAL LLP
1301 K STREET, N.W., SUITE 600, EAST TOWER
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005

MONTGOMERY, CHRISTOPHER
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP
100 SOUTH THIRD STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

HAND, EMMA F
SONNENSCHEIN NATH & ROSENTHAL LLP
1301 K STREET NW SUITE 600 EAST TOWER
WASHINGTON DC 20005

MEYER, DAVID A
ONE EAST FOURTH STREET SUITE 1400
CINCINNATI OH 45202

HAND, EMMA F
SONNENSCHEIN NATH & ROSENTHAL LLP
1301 K STREET NW SUITE 600 EAST TOWER
WASHINGTON DC 20005

KREIDER, KENNETH P.
KEATING, MUETHING & KLEKAMP PLL
ONE EAST FOURTH STREET, SUITE 1400
CINCINNATI OH 45202

*FLAHIVE, CAROLYN S
THOMPSON HINE LLP
41 SOUTH HIGH STREET SUITE 1700
COLUMBUS OH 43215-6101

ECKHART, HENRY W.
1200 CHAMBERS ROAD STE 106
COLUMBUS OH 43212

ALEXANDER, N TREVOR
CALFEE HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP
1100 FIFTH THIRD CENTER 21 EAST STATE STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215-4243

RODRIGUEZ, JESSE A ATTORNEY
300 EXELON WAY

DARR, FRANK P. ATTORNEY AT LAW
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC

KENNETT SQUARE PA 19348

21 EAST STATE STREET, 17TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215-422

GRACE, SANDY I
101 CONSTITUTION AVENUE SUITE 400 EAST
WASHINGTON DC 20001

HAEDT, ALLISON E. ATTORNEY AT LAW
JONES DAY
325 JOHN H. MCCONNELL BLVD., SUITE 600
COLUMBUS OH 43215-2673

ALLWEIN, CHRISTOPHER J
1373 GRANDVIEW AVE SUITE 212
COLUMBUS OH 43212

*MOSER, NOLAN M MR.
THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL
1207 GRANDVIEW AVE.
COLUMBUS OH 43212-3449

O'BRIEN , THOMAS
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP
100 SOUTH THIRD STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215-4291

*SANTARELLI, TARA
ENVIRONMENTAL LAW & POLICY CENTER
1207 GRANDVIEW AVE., STE. 201
COLUMBUS OH 43212

MEBANE, TERRANCE A
THOMPSON HINE LLP
41 S. HIGH STREET SUITE 1700
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*DUFFER, JENNIFER MRS.
ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.
222 EAST TOWN STREET 2ND FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

SMITH, HOLLY RACHEL
KEATING MUETHING & KLEKAMP PLL
HITT BUSINESS CENTER 3803 RECTORTOWN ROAD
MARSHALL VA 20115

MEBANE, TERRANCE A
THOMPSON HINE LLP
41 S. HIGH STREET SUITE 1700
COLUMBUS OH 43215

FISK, SHANNON
2 NORTH RIVERSIDE PLAZA SUITE 2250
CHICAGO IL 60606

ROYER, BARTH E
BELL & ROYER CO LPA
33 SOUTH GRANT AVENUE
COLUMBUS OH 43215-3927

*KALEPS-CLARK, LIJA K MS.
VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE
52 E. GAY ST. PO BOX 1008
COLUMBUS OH 43216

O'DONNELL, TERRENCE ATTORNEY
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP
100 SOUTH THIRD STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*RANDAZZO, SAMUEL C. MR.
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC
21 E. STATE STREET, 17TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*KALEPS-CLARK, LIJA K MS.
VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE
52 E. GAY ST. PO BOX 1008
COLUMBUS OH 43216

*SATTERWHITE, MATTHEW J MR.
AMERICAN ELECTRIC POWER SERVICE CORPORATION
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA, 29TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*KUTIK, DAVID A MR.
JONES DAY
901 LAKESIDE AVENUE
CLEVELAND OH 44114

LAWRENCE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION
BILL DINGUS

HAQUE , ASIM Z
250 WEST STREET

P.O. BOX 488
SOUTH POINT OH 45680-0488

AMERICAN ELECTRIC POWER SERVICE CORPORATION
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA, 29TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215-2373

ASSOCIATION OF INDEPENDENT COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES OF OHIO
41 S. HIGH STREET, SUITE 2720
COLUMBUS OH 43215-6152

CITY OF GROVE CITY
CHRISTOPHER L. MILLER, AT
250 WEST STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

COMPETE COALITION
1317 F. STREET NW SUITE 600
WASHINGTON DC 20004

CONSTELLATION ENERGY COMMODITIES GROUP, INC.
M.H. PETRICOFF, ATTORNEY
52 EAST GAY STREET P O BOX 1008
COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY INC
SENIOR COUNSEL
CYNTHIA FONNER BRADY
550 W WASHINGTON STREET SUITE 300
CHICAGO IL 60661

DOMINION RETAIL INC
ASSISTANT GENERAL COUNSEL
GARY A JEFFRIES
501 MARTINDALE STREET SUITE 400
PITTSBURGH PA 15212

DUKE ENERGY RETAIL SERVICES, LLC
DOROTHY K CORBETT
139 E. FORTH STREET, 1303
CONCINNATI OH 45202

ENERNOC INC
101 FEDERAL STREET SUITE 1100
BOSTON MA 02110

ENVIRONMENTAL LAW & POLICY CENTER
35 E. WACKER DR STE 1600

COLUMBUS OH 43215

JADWIN, JAY E COUNSEL OF RECORD
AMERICAN ELECTRIC POWER SERVICE CORPORATION
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA, 29TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

MILLER, CHRISTOPHER L
SCHOTTENSTEIN, ZOX AND DUNN CO LPA
250 WEST STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

CITY OF HILLIARD
CHRIS MILLER, ATTORNEY
SCHOTTENSTEIN, ZOX & DUNN CO., LPA
250 WEST STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

MASSEY, WILLIAM L
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
1201 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE, NW
WASHINGTON DC 20004-2401

ANTONS, LEO
1237 CISLER DR
MARIETTA OH 45750

*PETRICOFF, M HOWARD
VORYS SATER SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP
52 E. GAY STREET P.O. BOX 1008
COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

ROYER, BARTH E
BELL & ROYER CO LPA
33 SOUTH GRANT AVENUE
COLUMBUS OH 43215-3927

SPILLER, AMY
DUKE ENERGY OHIO
139 E. FOURTH STREET, 1303-MAIN P O BOX 961
CINCINNATI OH 45201-0960

POULOS, GREGORY J ATTORNEY
OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL
10 WEST BROAD ST. SUITE 1800
COLUMBUS OH 43215-3485

*SANTARELLI, TARA
ENVIRONMENTAL LAW & POLICY CENTER
1207 GRANDVIEW AVE., STE. 201

CHICAGO IL 60601-2206

ENVIRONMENTAL LAW AND POLICY CENTER
TARA SANTARELLI
1207 GRANDVIEW AVE, SUITE 201
COLUMBUS OH 43212

FIRSTENERGY SOLUTIONS CORP MANAGER MARKET INTELLIGENCE
LOUIS M D'ALESSANDRIS
341 WHITE POND DRIVE
AKRON OH 44320

KROGER COMPANY, THE
MR. DENIS GEORGE 1014 VINE STREET-GO7
CINCINNATI OH 45202-1100

OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL
1207 GRANDVIEW AVE. SUITE 201
COLUMBUS OH 43212-3449

OHIO MANUFACTURERS' ASSOCIATION
33 N HIGH STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

OHIO PARTNERS FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY
RINEBOLT DAVID C
231 WEST LIMA ST. PO BOX 1793
FINDLAY OH 45839-1793

ORMET PRIMARY ALUMINUM CORP.
P.O. BOX 176
HANNIBAL OH 43931

PAULDING WIND FARM LLC
STEVE HOWARD, ATTY
52 EAST GAY ST. P O BOX 1008
COLUMBUS OH 43215

RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY ASSOCIATION (RESA)
STEPHEN HOWARD
52 E. GAY ST.
COLUMBUS OH 43215

THE PJM POWER PROVIDERS GROUP
STEPHEN HOWARD, ATTORNEY
52 EAST GAY STREET P O BOX 1008
COLUMBUS OH 43216-1008

COLUMBUS OH 43212

EXELON GENERATION COMPANY LLC
SANDY I. GRACE, ATTY
101 CONSTITUTION AVE N.W. SUITE 400 EAST
WASHINGTON DC 200001

*HAYDEN, MARK A MR.
FIRSTENERGY CORP
76 SOUTH MAIN STREET
AKRON OH 44308

*YURICK, MARK
CHESTER WILLCOX & SAXBE LLP
65 E. STATE STREET SUITE 1000
COLUMBUS OH 43215

*DOUGHERTY, TRENT A MR.
OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL
1207 GRANDVIEW AVE. SUITE 201
COLUMBUS OH 43212

MCALISTER, LISA G
BRICKER & ECKLER
100 SOUTH THIRD STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215-4291

MOONEY, COLLEEN
231 WEST LIMA STREET
FINDLAY OH 45840

HAND, EMMA F
SONNENSCHEIN NATH & ROSENTHAL LLP
1301 K STREET NW SUITE 600 EAST TOWER
WASHINGTON DC 20005

MONTGOMERY, CHRISTOPHER
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP
100 SOUTH THIRD STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

THE DISTRIBUTED WIND ENERGY ASSOCIATION
TERRENCE O'DONNELL
100 SOUTH THIRD STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215-4291

WAL-MART STORES EAST, LP AND SAM'S EAST, INC
KENNETH KREIDER, ATTORNEY
ONE EAST FOURTH STREET SUITE 1400
CINCINNATI OH 45202

AEP RETAIL ENERGY PARTNERS LLC
ANNE M. VOGEL
1 RIVERSIDE PLAZA, 29TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

ASSOCIATION OF INDEPENDENT COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES OF OHIO
41 S. HIGH STREET, SUITE 2720
COLUMBUS OH 43215-6152

INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS OF OHIO GENERAL COUNSEL
SAMUEL C RANDAZZO
21 EAST STATE STREET, 17TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OH 43215

MEIGS COUNTY COMMISSIONERS
MICHAEL DAVENPORT, PRESIDENT
100 EAST SECOND STREET
POMEROY OH 45769

OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL
10 W. BROAD STREET SUITE 1800
COLUMBUS OH 43215-3485

TUSCARAWAS COUNTY
330 UNIVERSITY DRIVE NE
NEW PHILADELPHIA OH 44663

UNITED WAY OF JEFFERSON COUNTY
501 WASHINGTON STREET
P.O. BOX 1463
STEUBENVILLE OH 43952

WHITE, SCOTT MR.
INTERSTATE GAS SUPPLY, INC.
6100 EMERALD PKWY
DUBLIN OH 43016

JADWIN, JAY E
AEP
155 W NATIONWIDE BLVD SUITE 500
COLUMBUS OH 43215

JONES, C. TODD GENERAL COUNSEL
SCHOTTENSTEIN ZOX & DUNN CO LPA
250 WEST STREET
COLUMBUS OH 43215

OLIKER, JOSEPH E ATTORNEY
MCNEE WALLACE & NURICK LLC
21 EAST STATE STREET, 17TH FLOOR
COLUMBUS OHIO 43215

KRAVITZ, ZACHARY D.
CHESTER, WILCOX & SAXBE, LLP
65 EAST STATE STREET, STE 1000
COLUMBUS OH 43215

ETTER, TERRY
OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL
10 W. BROAD STREET SUITE 1800
COLUMBUS OH 43215